

**Committee on Mission Responsibility Through Investment (MRTI) of the Presbyterian Church U.S.A.**  
**Guideline Metrics - Company Scoring Evaluation**  
**January 2022**

**KEY**

**Priority weighting scale:** 5 = high; 3 = medium; 1 = low  
**Company Scores:** 2 = company is actively implementing; 1= company partially implementing; 0 = no evidence of implementation  
**Weighted score:** priority weight \* company score

**Guideline Metrics**

**Environment**

1. Climate-related risks and opportunities identified over short (2025), medium (2026-2035) and long-term (2036-2050) (TCFD and CA 100+)
2. The impact of climate-related risks and opportunities on the organization's businesses, strategy and financial planning described (TCFD and CA 100+)
3. Business strategy in place and efforts made to limit temperature increase to 1.5 degrees Celsius (GA 2018 and CA 100+)
4. Scenario analysis and measurement, including risk assessment on demand and supply, within key business processes and investment decisions incorporated. (GA 2016 and CA 100+)
5. Puts an adequate\* internal price on carbon and uses this price to make decisions on long-term projects (GA 2018 Carbon and CA 100+)  
\*World Bank, per TCFD, recommends carbon pricing ranging from \$40 to \$80/ ton by 2020, and increasing that to \$50 to \$100 by 2030. Powering America Forward to Clean Energy looks at a rate of at \$15/t and increasing each year. \$40 was cited as a more aggressive starting point. Adequate here should be around \$40.
6. Sets robust short (2025), medium (2026-2035) and long-term (2036-2050) goals for reducing greenhouse gas emissions (GA 2016 and CA 100+)
7. GHG reduction goals include evidence of more rapid integration of new technologies designed to reduce the company's overall carbon footprint (GA 2016 and CA 100+)
8. Company is working to decarbonize capital expenditures. (CA 100+)
9. Organization discloses metrics used to assess climate-related risks and opportunities in line with its strategy and risk management process, including methodology used to determine alignment of future capital expenditures (TCFD and CA 100+)
10. Discloses Scope 1, Scope 2 and if appropriate, Scope 3 GHG emissions, and related risks (TCFD and CA 100+)
11. Describes the targets used to manage climate-related risks and opportunities and performance against targets. (TCFD and CA 100+)
12. Issues annual reports on the company's view of and response to material climate change risks and opportunities (GA 2016 and CA 100+)
13. Carbon intensity of operations is showing downward trend.

| Priority weight | Chevron |                | Conoco Phillips |                | Duke  |                | Exxon |                | Ford  |                | GM    |                | Marathon |                | Phillips 66 |                | Valero |                |
|-----------------|---------|----------------|-----------------|----------------|-------|----------------|-------|----------------|-------|----------------|-------|----------------|----------|----------------|-------------|----------------|--------|----------------|
|                 | Score   | Weighted Score | Score           | Weighted Score | Score | Weighted Score | Score | Weighted Score | Score | Weighted Score | Score | Weighted Score | Score    | Weighted Score | Score       | Weighted Score | Score  | Weighted Score |
| 3               | 2       | 6              | 2               | 6              | 2     | 6              | 2     | 6              | 2     | 6              | 2     | 6              | 2        | 6              | 2           | 6              | 2      | 6              |
| 3               | 2       | 6              | 2               | 6              | 2     | 6              | 1     | 3              | 2     | 6              | 2     | 6              | 2        | 6              | 2           | 6              | 1      | 3              |
| 5               | 0       | 0              | 0               | 0              | 1     | 5              | 0     | 0              | 2     | 10             | 2     | 10             | 0        | 0              | 0           | 0              | 0      | 0              |
| 5               | 1       | 5              | 1               | 5              | 2     | 10             | 1     | 5              | 1     | 5              | 1     | 5              | 1        | 5              | 1           | 5              | 1      | 5              |
| 5               | 1       | 5              | 2               | 10             | 1     | 5              | 0     | 0              | 1     | 5              | 1     | 5              | 0        | 0              | 0           | 0              | 0      | 0              |
| 5               | 1       | 5              | 1               | 5              | 1     | 5              | 1     | 5              | 2     | 10             | 2     | 10             | 1        | 5              | 1           | 5              | 0      | 0              |
| 5               | 1       | 5              | 1               | 5              | 2     | 10             | 1     | 5              | 2     | 10             | 2     | 10             | 1        | 5              | 1           | 5              | 1      | 5              |
| 3               | 0       | 0              | 0               | 0              | 0     | 0              | 0     | 0              | 0     | 0              | 0     | 0              | 0        | 0              | 0           | 0              | 0      | 0              |
| 3               | 2       | 6              | 1               | 3              | 2     | 6              | 1     | 3              | 2     | 6              | 2     | 6              | 2        | 6              | 1           | 3              | 1      | 3              |
| 5               | 1       | 5              | 2               | 10             | 2     | 10             | 1     | 5              | 2     | 10             | 2     | 10             | 1        | 5              | 1           | 5              | 0      | 0              |
| 3               | 1       | 3              | 1               | 3              | 1     | 3              | 1     | 3              | 2     | 6              | 2     | 6              | 1        | 3              | 0           | 0              | 0      | 0              |
| 5               | 2       | 10             | 2               | 10             | 2     | 10             | 2     | 10             | 2     | 10             | 2     | 10             | 2        | 10             | 2           | 10             | 1      | 5              |
| 3               | 0       | 0              | 2               | 6              | 1     | 3              | 1     | 3              | 2     | 6              | 2     | 6              | 0        | 0              | 0           | 0              | 1      | 3              |

## Guideline Metrics

14. Water risk:  
 14a. Water is included in company's business strategy planning.  
 14b. Company identifies operations in water-stressed areas.  
 14c. Mitigation programs are in place for efficient water use.  
 14d. There is evidence of water-efficient technology for operations. (GA – Water)

15. Land and Biodiversity:  
 15a. Do operations adversely impact biodiversity?  
 15b. Is there a corporate policy and risk management process in place concerning energy, land and biodiversity?  
 15c. Do operations lead to deforestation?

16. Company evaluates impact of its products on the environment. (MRTI)

17. Waste management  
 17a. Company discloses management of hazardous materials/ waste.  
 17b. Solid waste reduction efforts are in place.  
 17c. waste management includes wastewater treatment (MRTI)

### Social

1. Company has the following in place:  
 a) Policy commitment to respect human rights  
 b) A human rights due diligence process to identify, prevent, mitigate, and account for how they address their impacts on human rights  
 c) Processes to enable the remediation of any adverse human rights impacts they cause or which they contribute (above from UN)  
 d) Public commitment to prevent human trafficking and upholding human rights  
 e) Evaluation of impact of its products on human rights (MRTI and GA 2014 – Human Rights)

2. Do operations distress neighboring communities and/or historically marginalized/ oppressed communities (often Black, Indigenous and communities of color)? If so, company takes steps to mitigate those impacts. (S&P and GA 2018 ER)  
 (For example, does the company pay for and implement land restoration of affected areas?)

3. Risk management program includes environmental and social impacts on neighbors (e.g., emissions' impact on local air quality, lending impact on local communities). (S&P, GA 2016 and GA 2018 ER)

4. Operations are considered from the perspective of their impact on employees, local communities, and society. (S&P, MRTI and GA 2012)

5. Company regularly engages with employees and customers to learn their needs and satisfaction. (S&P)

6. Do operations and/or products create reputational issues\* for the company? If so, how are those issues managed and mitigated? (S&P, GA 2012 and GA 2008 God's Work)

\*Possible reputational issues might include events related to employee safety, diversity, benefits, sexual harassment, pay issues, etc.

7. Company takes steps in terms of occupational health, safety, and wellbeing of employees (S&P and GA 2012)

8. Company takes steps in terms of occupational health, safety, and wellbeing of suppliers, including supplier codes of conduct and enforcement of human rights with suppliers. (S&P and GA 2016: Just Compensation)

9. Does company participate in the Voluntary Principles on Security and Human Rights?

10. Does company operate in conflict-affected and high-risk areas? (GA 2008) - if "yes", see endnote RE MRTI human rights policy implementation.

11. Corporate Human Rights Benchmark score

12. Other comments/ other human rights concerns?

Company scores

Approved by MRTI January 19, 2022

| Priority weight | Chevron   |                | Conoco Phillips |                | Duke      |                | Exxon     |                | Ford      |                | GM        |                | Marathon  |                | Phillips 66 |                | Valero    |                |
|-----------------|-----------|----------------|-----------------|----------------|-----------|----------------|-----------|----------------|-----------|----------------|-----------|----------------|-----------|----------------|-------------|----------------|-----------|----------------|
|                 | Score     | Weighted Score | Score           | Weighted Score | Score     | Weighted Score | Score     | Weighted Score | Score     | Weighted Score | Score     | Weighted Score | Score     | Weighted Score | Score       | Weighted Score | Score     | Weighted Score |
| 5               | 1         | 5              | 2               | 10             | 1         | 5              | 1         | 5              | 2         | 10             | 2         | 10             | 1         | 5              | 1           | 5              | 1         | 5              |
| 1               | 0         | 0              | 1               | 1              | 2         | 2              | 0         | 0              | 2         | 2              | 2         | 2              | 0         | 0              | 2           | 2              | 1         | 1              |
| 1               | 1         | 1              | 1               | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1           | 1              | 1         | 1              |
| 1               | 1         | 1              | 1               | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 2         | 2              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1           | 1              | 1         | 1              |
|                 |           |                |                 |                |           |                |           |                |           |                |           |                |           |                |             |                |           |                |
| 3               | 1         | 3              | 2               | 6              | 1         | 3              | 0         | 0              | 1         | 3              | 2         | 6              | 0         | 0              | 0           | 0              | 1         | 3              |
| 5               | 0         | 0              | 0               | 0              | 1         | 5              | 0         | 0              | 1         | 5              | 1         | 5              | 0         | 0              | 0           | 0              | 1         | 5              |
| 5               | 1         | 5              | 1               | 5              | 1         | 5              | 0         | 0              | 1         | 5              | 1         | 5              | 1         | 5              | 1           | 5              | 1         | 5              |
| 5               | 1         | 5              | 1               | 5              | 1         | 5              | 1         | 5              | 1         | 5              | 1         | 5              | 1         | 5              | 1           | 5              | 1         | 5              |
| 1               | 1         | 1              | 2               | 2              | 2         | 2              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1           | 1              | 1         | 1              |
| 1               | 0         | 0              | 1               | 1              | 1         | 1              | 0         | 0              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1           | 1              | 1         | 1              |
| 1               | 1         | 1              | 1               | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 2         | 2              | 2         | 2              | 1         | 1              | 1           | 1              | 1         | 1              |
| 1               | 1         | 1              | 1               | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 1         | 1              | 0         | 0              | 0           | 0              | 0         | 0              |
| 0               | info only |                | info only       |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only   |                | info only |                |
| 0               | info only |                | info only       |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only   |                | info only |                |
| 0               | info only |                | info only       |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only   |                | info only |                |
| 0               | info only |                | info only       |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only |                | info only   |                | info only |                |

## Guideline Metrics

### Governance

1. Employee compensation is fair and adequate. (GA 2012)
2. The company supports the right of workers to organize, bargain collectively and advocate for family sustaining wages and benefits. (GA 2012)
3. Clearly defines board and management governance processes that acknowledge the scientific evidence of climate change (GA 2016) and importance of other social issues, including non-discrimination, promotion of equal opportunities and diversity. (CA 100 + and GA 2016)
4. Ensures adequate oversight of climate change risk (GA 2016) and human rights issues (CA 100+)
5. Outlines strategic implications of a transition to low carbon energy system (GA 2016)
6. Board member analysis (MRTI) (includes board diversity\*) (CA100+) \*(diversity refers to diversity of demographics, experience/expertise, and inclusion of domestic and international experience)
7. Company leadership analysis for diversity\* (\*diversity refers to diversity of demographics and experience as info is publicly available) (MRTI, REAC)
8. Company has measures in place to promote employee diversity (MRTI, REAC)
9. Engages constructively with public policymakers and other stakeholders [in support of cost-effective policy measures to mitigate climate change risks and support low-carbon investments] (GA 2016 and GA 2016 Election Protection)
10. Ensures there is broad oversight and transparency about the company's lobbying activity and political spending, including activity by trade associations to which the company belongs, on climate change and related energy and regulatory issues (GA 2016: Election Protection and CA 100+, and other human rights and social issues. (CA100+ and GA 2014- Human Rights)
11. Company discloses positions on public policy issues such as: carbon pricing, renewable energy targets, and international negotiations on climate change (GA 2016 and GA 2016: Election Protection).
12. Company discloses positions on internal policy issues such as: corporate leave policies and freedom of association (GA 2008 God's Work)
13. Company regularly engages with regulatory and other legal authorities to keep abreast of legal, regulatory and compliance developments. (S&P)
14. Company is transparent on which office to contact regarding environmental/ social concerns and includes contact information. (MRTI)

### Total Score

| Priority weight | Chevron |                | Conoco Phillips |                | Duke  |                | Exxon |                | Ford  |                | GM    |                | Marathon |                | Phillips 66 |                | Valero |                |
|-----------------|---------|----------------|-----------------|----------------|-------|----------------|-------|----------------|-------|----------------|-------|----------------|----------|----------------|-------------|----------------|--------|----------------|
|                 | Score   | Weighted Score | Score           | Weighted Score | Score | Weighted Score | Score | Weighted Score | Score | Weighted Score | Score | Weighted Score | Score    | Weighted Score | Score       | Weighted Score | Score  | Weighted Score |
| 1               | 2       | 2              | 1               | 1              | 2     | 2              | 1     | 1              | 1     | 1              | 1     | 1              | 1        | 1              | 1           | 1              | 1      | 1              |
| 1               | 1       | 1              | 1               | 1              | 0     | 0              | 1     | 1              | 1     | 1              | 1     | 1              | 0        | 0              | 1           | 1              | 1      | 1              |
| 5               | 1       | 5              | 1               | 5              | 2     | 10             | 1     | 5              | 2     | 10             | 2     | 10             | 1        | 5              | 1           | 5              | 1      | 5              |
| 5               | 1       | 5              | 1               | 5              | 1     | 5              | 1     | 5              | 2     | 10             | 2     | 10             | 1        | 5              | 1           | 5              | 1      | 5              |
| 3               | 1       | 3              | 2               | 6              | 2     | 6              | 1     | 3              | 2     | 6              | 2     | 6              | 1        | 3              | 1           | 3              | 1      | 3              |
| 3               | 2       | 6              | 2               | 6              | 1     | 3              | 1     | 3              | 2     | 6              | 2     | 6              | 1        | 3              | 2           | 6              | 2      | 6              |
| 1               | 1       | 1              | 1               | 1              | 1     | 1              | 1     | 1              | 1     | 1              | 1     | 1              | 1        | 1              | 2           | 2              | 0      | 0              |
| 1               | 2       | 2              | 2               | 2              | 2     | 2              | 1     | 1              | 2     | 2              | 2     | 2              | 1        | 1              | 1           | 1              | 0      | 0              |
| 3               | 1       | 3              | 1               | 3              | 1     | 3              | 0     | 0              | 1     | 3              | 1     | 3              | 0        | 0              | 1           | 3              | 0      | 0              |
| 5               | 1       | 5              | 1               | 5              | 1     | 5              | 1     | 5              | 1     | 5              | 1     | 5              | 1        | 5              | 1           | 5              | 1      | 5              |
| 3               | 1       | 3              | 2               | 6              | 0     | 0              | 1     | 3              | 1     | 3              | 1     | 3              | 1        | 3              | 1           | 3              | 0      | 0              |
| 3               | 1       | 3              | 1               | 3              | 1     | 3              | 1     | 3              | 1     | 3              | 1     | 3              | 1        | 3              | 1           | 3              | 1      | 3              |
| 1               | 1       | 1              | 1               | 1              | 1     | 1              | 1     | 1              | 1     | 1              | 1     | 1              | 1        | 1              | 1           | 1              | 1      | 1              |
| 1               | 0       | 0              | 0               | 0              | 1     | 1              | 0     | 0              | 1     | 1              | 1     | 1              | 0        | 0              | 1           | 1              | 1      | 1              |
| 119             |         | 119.00         |                 | 148.00         |       | 153.00         |       | 95.00          |       | 181.00         |       | 183.00         |          | 102.00         |             | 107.00         |        | 90.00          |

**Recommended score key**

**Red:** Overall, company may have poor record of shareholder engagement, poor record on environmental, social and governance (ESG) issues. Company may or may not acknowledge importance of ESG issues.

0-100

**Orange:** Company acknowledges importance of ESG issues, may or may not adopt policies to address the issues. Has conducted some shareholder engagement or is open to it. May not have displayed much progress in shareholder engagement.

101-135

**Yellow:** Company may show more progress on shareholder engagement; may begin to implement ESG policy with programs/plans, goals and targets; develops metrics, starts measuring and disclosing information.

136-170

**Blue:** Good track record of shareholder engagement. Company benchmarks its progress against others in industry/sector; conducts independent verification of its data and operations. Policies, programs, goals and targets in place for ESG issues and regularly discloses information.

171-205

**Green:** Company showing great efforts on shareholder engagement; is actively addressing ESG issues and there are few concerns. Company's strategic focus leads to demonstrable positive impact

206-238